

In the afterword, Michael Burawoy places the book's ethnographic case studies in the global historical context of the third wave marketization which started in the 1970s. Industrial sites of the Global South and the postsocialist societies in his words therefore demonstrate how "those who have been dispossessed, often violently, of access to the means of existence and locked out of the market" shape the current conditions of production (Burawoy 2018, 361).

In summary, this book offers a wide range of diverse ethnographic studies covering several prominent topics concerning precarity, such as the role of the nation-state, the diminishing power of organized labor, workers' political passivity, and the questions of class formation and class fragmentation. It presents rich ethnographic descriptions of inhumane working conditions and the effects of precarious work on workers' lives. The book's authors also show how previous inequalities of ethnicity, age, and gender are deepening under the increased precarity of work. The book's greatest contribution is the focus on the industrial settings of the Global South, which remain relatively understudied by anthropologists. However, the collection of articles is intended for the knowledgeable reader, as many of the applied concepts are not theorized. Nevertheless, it offers an important insight into the casualization of work and its impact on industrial workers in the Global South and postsocialist societies, which differ greatly from those of the Global North, and therefore establishes a more nuanced anthropological perspective on the issue.

Polona Hazl
(Charles University)

References

- Cepić, Dražen. 2019. *Class Cultures in Post-Socialist Eastern Europe*. London, New York: Routledge.
- Kasmir, Sharryn. 2018. "Precarity". *The Cambridge Encyclopaedia of Anthropology*. <http://doi.org/10.29164/18precarity>
- Standing, Guy. 2011. *The Precariat: The New Dangerous Class*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Stenning, Alison. 2005. "Where is the Post-Socialist Working Class? Working-Class Lives in the Spaces of (Post-)Socialism". *Sociology* 39 (5): 983–999.

Nili Belkind *Music in Conflict: Palestine, Israel, and the Politics of Aesthetic Production*

Routledge, 2021

If we take into account the breaking news from spring and summer 2021, when Israeli-Palestinian conflicts slid from hibernation into bilateral open acts of violence, the book by Israeli-American ethnomusicologist Nili Belkind becomes very relevant. The Israel-Palestine region is an example of a very heterogeneous society suffering from a lengthy conflict with regularly recurring outbreaks of violence. Music-making in such a social field, including people with experience of war and occupying powers, represents a complex and multifaceted "web of signs". Multiple significance is embodied in musical sound itself, in repertoires, venues, settings, and contexts of events and their organization processes, as well as in their actors' thinking, agency, and positioning within both the Israeli and the Palestinian communities.

The first general ethnographic accounts on Palestine appeared in the 1980s. The so-called Oslo process and the hope for reconciliation initiated a way of more intensive cultural production in the 1990s, including music-making. Many music-related studies then focused on the cultural politics of reconciliation or on Israel's relationship with its Arab and Palestinian minorities, in Israel and in the region (e.g., Al-Tae 2002; Beckles Willson 2009a; Belkind 2010; Brinner 2009; Dardashti 2009; Perelson 1998; Regev 1995). Four books published in 2013 deal with the role of music in Palestinian life (Beckles Willson 2013; Kanaaneh et al. 2013; Maira 2013; McDonald 2013b). Building upon their work, Belkind's monograph represents a very recent musical ethnography study of the fraught and complicated cultural politics of music-making in the Israel-Palestine area in the post-Oslo era of the early 2010s.

The author's main argument in the book is that music-making continues to provide platforms and occasions in which ethnonational divisions in the Israel-Palestine region are maintained and transgressed, as well as the most suitable lenses through which to study the interweaving of culture and politics. According to Belkind, "music is an especially rich site for tracking the mutually constitutive aspects of culture and politics because of its performative and participatory nature, its publicness, its circulatory unboundedness, and the ways in which its modes of signification and reception combine analytic and affective realms of perception. Music can be read as a social text, perceived as an embodied, sensory experience, and *felt* as projection of the Self. In

short, music combines different ways of knowing. It is hence a potent instrument of governmentality as well as a powerful medium for projecting and mobilizing oppositional individual and/or collective agency" (12). Each chapter presents different modalities of music-making situated in different personal and communal geographies, and the ways that the musical activities cross different geographical and social boundaries in the midst of a violent conflict. The monograph, therefore, explores the field of state-supported, as well as independent, music-making of diverse music genres on both the Jewish and Arab-Palestinian sides of the "Green Line" of Israel-Palestine, and in this sense follows Josh Kun's (2001) call to theorize the "aural border".

The monograph is based on ethnographic data gathered by Belkind from January 2011 to September 2012. Therefore, her fieldwork overlapped temporally with the Arab Spring as well as with the largest contemporary social protest movement in Israel. At the same time, Palestine attempted to gain recognition as an independent state in the UN and was accepted by UNESCO. These circumstances enabled the author to conduct a unique "ethnography-in-motion". By "following the music", Belkind "followed the conflict" on both the Israeli and Palestinian sides. She chose Jaffa as her fieldwork "base". First, because of its mixed Palestinian-Jewish demography. Second, the location of Jaffa facilitated access to the Northern city of Haifa and the Galilee region, as well as to Jerusalem and West Bank sites. While working as a volunteer in Israeli institutions that promote Arab-Jewish coexistence projects and in Palestinian

conservatories in the West Bank, Belkind deeply immersed herself in the field on both sides of the wall. She experienced the philosophy and everyday practice of these varied institutions and she could establish close relationships with her informants within these places. The author interviewed numerous artists, producers, music educators, and actors from different music scenes, ranging from European and Arabic classical music, to local folk and popular music. She engaged in participant observation and filmed performances in a very diverse spectrum of venues, ranging from concert halls to demonstrations, community centres to checkpoints, restaurants and nightclubs to a refugee camp, children's clubs and home rooftops.

It should be appreciated that the monograph also includes a very personal confession and detailed explications concerning the author's multifaceted positioning in the field. Nili Belkind was born in Israel to a Zionist family. Her ancestors were considered "first pioneers", prominent members of the first Jewish immigration wave in 1882 (*'aliyah rishonah*). However, in connection with the first Lebanon war from 1982–1983 and the revelation of the Sabra and Shatila refugee camp massacres, Belkind decided to leave Israel and move to the USA. She lived there for a few decades and took a critical stance on the current Israeli politico-ideological narratives. When Belkind returned to Israel in 2008 and then started conducting her research as an Israeli-American, she was fully fluent in the Hebrew language and familiar with Israeli-Jewish musical and cultural terrain. However, she faced several problems. First, having learnt standard Arabic at an American university, she was

unable to understand Palestinian Arabic dialect at the beginning of her fieldwork. Second, she lacked local contacts as well as personal acquaintance with the terrain in the Occupied Territories. Third, the main problem represented logistical and travel restrictions imposed on Jewish-Israelis travelling to Occupied Territories. Here, it was Belkind's American passport that enabled her to bypass these restrictions. The author's American citizenship counted in her favour also when doing research in Ramallah and some other places, where she was advised to downplay her Israeli background. However, a surprising recognition of Belkind's "Palestinian" heritage presented a remarkable coincidence: one of her father's relatives was adopted by a Palestinian family. In this sense, the author could shift among several personal identities according to circumstances in the field.

The book is not a music genre-based analysis. Instead, it is prominently anchored in the study of musical performances and their contexts as sites of multiple and multilateral meaning-making. The author also moves away from simple binary categories of hegemony and resistance and self-contained Palestinian/Israeli teleological narratives and reflexive constructions of nationhood, seeking to develop a contrapuntal reading of Israel and Palestine that complicates their ontological boundaries. Belkind refers to the Birmingham School of Cultural Studies and Stuart Hall's (1996) influential analytical framework, which regards identity as constantly negotiated by multiple actors and approaches expressive culture as a socially constructive process marked by shifts and internal contradictions. In this sense, the ethnomusicological

research conducted in Israel-Palestine brings an exemplary case of hyphenated identities articulated through music. Here Belkind refers to “third time-space” and “diverse geographies of identities” (Lavie and Swedenburg 1996) demonstrating that musical activities and their interpretations are situated in between coexistence and resistance through the multiplicity of subjectivities and also multiplicity of space(s). While deterritorializing the fixity of binary constructs, the monograph also follows up the edited volume by Rebecca L. Stein and Ted Swedenburg (2005) and the argumentation of other historians who emphasize that mutual interactions and interdependencies of Israel-Palestine have been muted in favour of advancing nationalist narratives, mutually denying the existence of either the Israeli or the Palestinian nation. Additionally, the book challenges the popular opinion that music has a recuperative power in conflict situations. Here Belkind’s findings also resonate with other ethnomusicologists’ critiques (e.g., O’Connell and Castelo-Branco 2010), which regard the “music as coexistence” trope with suspicion. It should be noted that music often serves different functions along the peace and war continuum: music can serve as an instrument both of reconciliation and of physical and mental torture, as well as many more functions in between.

The book has the following outline. Chapter One focuses on one of the prominent West Bank music schools, Al-Kamandjâti music conservatory, whose curriculum covers both Arabic and Western classical music (Western classical music is regarded here as an “art of resistance”). The author presents several

case studies (e.g., various concerts, including students’ participation in the contested space of East Jerusalem, or performances in the town of Abu Dis Palestinian, or at the al-Am’ari refugee camp), which convey the conservatory’s position on Palestinian nationmaking, resistance, and conceptions of democracy. Ethnographic vignettes, along with insights into informants’ lives and perspectives, show how these cultural and political aims are explicitly and implicitly lived and practiced through musical activities, individual reflections, institutional discourses, and aesthetic content. Therefore, they also reveal local negotiations of Palestinian sovereignty and the manifestation of this sovereignty both within the community and on the outside to foreign powers.

Chapter Two deals with multicultural choral projects of coexistence organized by the Jaffa Arab-Jewish Community Center: the Voices of Peace choir and the Shirana women’s choir. Despite contemporary exclusionary neo-Zionist trends and Palestinian critiques of such projects, musical activities here are conceived as a means of resolving tensions between Arabs and Jews in Israel, by showcasing and fostering more egalitarian models of citizenship and offering a space for a constitution of “cross-ethnic” identities. Belkind explores in this regard both the integrative value of these projects for their actors as well as their dissonances in the sense of “whitewashing” violent political realities. On the one hand, members regard the choirs as an integrated space of belonging and togetherness, where common humanity, “female solidarity”, and “safe spaces” sublimate differences. From the broader Palestinian point of view, on

the other hand, such collaborations in fact enable “normalization” (*tatbīʿ*) – naturalizing unequal social relations and in that way supporting the oppressive occupation regime. From the 2000s, a growing legislative and discursive drive by the Israeli state turned away from a Jewish-Palestinian relations-building effort to “Judaicize” the country. In addition, she argues that multicultural artistic and cultural projects nowadays are unable to reach the Occupied Territories as they did during the 1990s peace process, for both logistical and ideological reasons.

Chapter Three approaches the phenomenon of playing music in the context of “bureaucratic violence” by featuring several ethnographic accounts of performances at Israeli-Palestine border checkpoints (including a performance by the Al-Kamandjati orchestra at the main Qalandiya checkpoint). Since 2001, when a construction of the separation wall began, the West Bank / Occupied Palestine area became a specific habitat full of checkpoints. The spatial and temporal restrictions have in this way simultaneously become signifiers of identity, while they induce the transformation of embedded experiences of violence into sites of creativity. Belkind here presents borders as a master trope in Palestinian lives and discusses the relationship between music and space.

Some recent ethnomusicology monographs demonstrated the immeasurable role of musical activities within social protest movements taking place in urban spaces such as Kiev and Bangkok (Sonevytsky 2019; Tausig 2019). Chapter Four similarly examines the cultural and sociopolitical engagement of the mixed

Jewish-Palestinian city of Jaffa with the nationwide summer 2011 Israeli social protest movement, and it describes how musical activities mediated the social protests’ narrative. In this case, ethnonational tensions were subsumed by “periphery” class-based Mizrahi (Oriental) Jewish-Palestinian alliances against the Ashkenazi-Israeli “centre”. However, Belkind noticed only the hesitant and partial participation of Palestinian-Israeli citizens in this movement.

Lastly, Chapter Five focuses on personages of two distinct Palestinian musicians and citizens of Israel, who are in fact “strangers in their homeland”, performing in a liminal space and for both Jewish and Palestinian audiences: Amal Murkus and Jowan Safadi. The musicians are associated with different spheres of activities, music genres, audiences, and political ideologies. Amal Murkus is Israel’s leading Palestinian female singer, who became famous as an artist as well as a representative of Israel’s binational communist party. She experiments with several musical styles, including music associated with the international left, Palestinian folk, classical Arabic music, and a broader world music aesthetic. On the contrary, the singer-songwriter Jowan Safadi, who is aligned with the Palestinian alternative music scene of Haifa, draws on various popular music genres including electronica, punk, and Arabic hard rock. The author eloquently presents their own way of negotiating the exilic experience.

In conclusion, the monograph is very well balanced, combining ethnographic vignettes, interviews, and participants’ portraits with a broader historical

background, solid factography, and theoretical linking. Belkind refers to a large spectrum of authors rooted in various disciplines including history, cultural geography, ethnomusicology, cultural anthropology, sociology, and conflict and reconciliation studies. The book fully accomplishes the author's aim to analyse the politics of sound and the ways by which music-making and related discourses reflect and constitute identities, affect public spheres, and contextualize political action.

Zita Skořepová

(Czech Academy of Sciences)

References

- Al-Tae, Nasser. 2002. "Voices of Peace and the Legacy of Reconciliation: Popular Music, Nationalism and the Quest for Peace in the Middle East". *Popular Music* 21 (1): 41–61.
- Beckles Wilson, Rachel. 2013. *Orientalism and Musical Mission: Palestine and the West*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Beckles Willson, Rachel. 2009. "Whose Utopia? Perspectives on the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra". *Music and Politics* 3 (2): 1–21.
- Belkind, Nili. 2010. "A Message for Peace or a Tool for Oppression? Israeli Jewish- Arab Duo Achinoam Nini and Mira Awad's Representation of Israel at Eurovision 2009". *Current Musicology* 45 (89): 7–35.
- Dardashti, Galeet. 2009. "Sing Us a Mawwal: The Politics of Culture-Brokering Palestinian- Israelis in Israel". *Israel Studies in Musicology Online* 7 (2): 62–91.
- Hall, Stuart. 1996. "Who Needs Identity?" In *Questions of Cultural Identity*, edited by Stewart Hall, and Paul du Gay, 1–17. London; Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Kanaanah, Moslih, et al. 2013. *Palestinian Music and Song: Expression and Resistance Since 1900*. Bloomington; Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.
- Kun, Josh. 2001. "Listening to the Line: Notes on Music, Globalization, and the US–Mexico Border". *Iberoamericana* 5 (17): 143–152.
- Lavie, Smadar, and Ted Swedenburg. 1996. *Displacement, Diaspora, and Geographies of Identity*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Maira, Sunaina. 2013. *Jil Oslo: Palestinian Hip Hop, Youth Culture, and the Youth Movement*. Washington, DC: Tadween Publishing.
- McDonald, David. 2013. *My Voice is My Weapon: Music, Nationalism, and the Poetics of Palestinian Resistance*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- O'Connell, John Morgan, and Salwa El-Shawan Castelo-Branco. 2010. *Music and Conflict*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Perelson, Inbal. 1998. "Power Relations in the Israeli Popular Music System". *Popular Music* 17 (1): 113–128.
- Regev, Motti. 1995. "Present Absentee: Arab Music in Israeli Culture." *Public Culture* 7: 433–445.
- Sonevytsky, Maria. 2019. *Wild Music: Sound and Sovereignty in Ukraine*. Music/Culture Series. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.
- Stein, Rebecca L., and Ted Swedenburg, eds. 2005. *Palestine, Israel, and the Politics of Popular Culture*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Tausig, Benjamin. 2019. *Bangkok is Ringing: Sound, Protest, and Constraint*. New York: Oxford University Press.